

CITY BEAUTIFICATION AND THE CRY OF THE MARGINALIZED; MEDIA FRAMING OF RESETTLEMENT ISSUES IN ENGLISH NEWSPAPERS

Tendral Rajagopal * C Velayutham **

INTRODUCTION AND OVERVIEW

Slum clearance led to resettling people from where they were earlier residing to an entirely new environment. This has resulted in many shifts, precisely in their livelihood, economy, and psychology of the people. Nearly 2.4 million people are internally displaced in India as of 2019 due to various factors such as developmental projects, natural disasters, or political conflict. This resulted in a lot of shifts, precisely in their livelihood, economy, and psychology of the people. The miserable plight of marginalized people is the aftermath of urban development. Media plays a pivotal role in addressing the issue of the marginalized section of the society. However, the media's role is limited to merely reporting the event. There are particular agendas and framing methods adopted by the print media, shaping the people's perspective. Media has the power to educate and throw light on unrecognized issues like resettlement. Resettlement and displacement are triggered due to various factors such as developmental projects, natural disasters, or political conflicts. Resettlement could occur due to private or public good, and most resettlements and displacements are involuntary. This paper will study how English newspapers cover and publish news related to resettlement and the framing adopted by print media. This paper is also going to focus on the news weight age of news related to displacement. The methodology adopted in this paper is critical framing analysis and content analysis.

LITERATURE REVIEW

Through frames analysis, the researcher can identify the vital players in the marginalized group and their interests. Examining and analyzing the frames allows the researcher to uncover how the issues surrounding marginalized people are framed in the mainstream media. (Stacy Lynn Sant, 2013)

The role of media discourse is to fight against the discrimination of marginalized groups. Media discourse is how reality is shaped by the mainstream media and not merely about how reality is represented. Media discourses have the power to legitimize and

* Research Student, Department of Media Sciences, Anna University, Chennai, India - 600025.

** Assistant Professor, Department of Media Sciences, Anna University, Chennai, India - 600025.

delegitimize society's social practices. (Zarko Trajanoski, 2011)

Marginalized groups or individuals are socially, politically, and economically vulnerable. They have fewer resources and more significant needs and are exposed to greater harm due to exclusion from critical resources and amenities. Research related to marginalized communities should aim to lift the community and not further marginalize the community through the research findings. (Katy E Pearce, 2020)

The displacement of individuals in India is triggered by factors like development projects, political conflict, fixing protected area networks and conservation areas, and natural disasters, amongst others. Resettlement and rehabilitation are often misunderstood as being interlinked. However, resettlement is the physical relocation of people, and rehabilitation is an ongoing process of building people's assets, livelihoods, social networks, culture, and economic and psychological acceptance. (Samling, 2015)

Despite the dominant negative framing of expatriate problems at the national level, the regional media used positive, humanizing frames and various sources in articles on native topics like refugees' personal stories. This reflects the community-building role of native journalism and challenges the acquainted boundaries of the controversy. (Cooper S, 2017)

The researcher identifies two types of framing: thematic and episodic. The thematic frame concentrates on the overall issue and has a broader interpretation or coverage, while episodic framing focuses only on a particular episode, event or issue. Focusing only on episodic framing while ignoring thematic frames may hamper the broader perspective and interpretation of the issue. (Iyengar, 1991).

The researcher identifies three main framing tasks: Diagnostic, Prognostic and motivational. The diagnostic framing type talks about the conflict, issue, or dispute that arises. Prognostic deals with solutions and recommendations to resolve the issue, and motivational framing serves as a call to action. (Snow Benford, 1988)

AIM

The aim is to understand, identify and analyze media representation of marginalized people and the frames adopted by English newspapers, reporting resettlement and displacement issues.

OBJECTIVES

1. To study the impact of media representation and resettlement on the lives of marginalized people.
2. To identify the prominent news frames English newspapers adopted in their coverage

of resettlement and displacement.

3. To analyze how English newspaper frames represent marginalized people and resettlement issues.

RESEARCH DESIGN

The research employed in this study is qualitative research methodology. Within the qualitative framework, an inductive approach is used to delineate the frames. Parameters denote the various variables and characteristics defining the population under study, guiding the qualitative assessment. Due to language constraints and time limitations, the researcher selected three prominent English newspapers, namely The Times of India, The New Indian Express, and The Hindu, for analysis, encompassing 79 news articles. The researcher has identified nine parameters pertinent to this investigation. Content analysis will be predicated upon these parameters, which include date, pagination, number of columns, source of news, significance, tone of reporting, photographs, Contrast, and solution. The parameter focuses on frame elements and aims to analyze and quantify the headline, sub-heading, lead, and comprehensive article. The research investigates two frame types: thematic and episodic. The thematic frame pertains to broad coverage of the issue, whereas the episodic frame is centred on specific events.

RESULTS: EMERGING INDUCED FRAMES

The content of 79 articles has been studied and analyzed in-depth by the researcher. And based on the parameters established, the researchers have induced 15 frames. The waste management frame is significant in resettlement sites. Inadequate waste disposal and lack of awareness compromise hygiene and sanitation in these areas. Further, the Livelihood frame has been identified by the researchers. The researcher notes that insufficient amenities impact livelihoods in relocated regions. Essential services such as hospitals, schools, and transportation are absent. The quality of housing construction in resettlement is typically substandard. Poor water quality poses health risks and contributes to waterborne diseases.

Consequently, the physical and social infrastructure frame is necessary. Child care and nutrition are crucial to safeguard children's health during and after post-resettlement. The physical and physiological health frame aims to raise awareness regarding the marginalized group's neglected conditions. Resettlement severely affects their mental health. The civic aid frame highlights the importance of citizen responsibility towards societal welfare. Every individual must contribute to environmental preservation. The sustainable development frame underscores the need for durable housing and amenities for slum inhabitants. The government is urged to adopt a sustainable approach to resettlement

practices. The law and order frame addresses safety concerns prevalent in resettled areas, particularly for women and children. The accountability frame reveals the communication gap between officials and the affected populace. Many individuals lack knowledge about whom to approach for specific issues. There is significant distress among the impoverished regarding official accountability. The water and sanitation frame emphasizes residents' water scarcity challenges in resettled zones. A severe water shortage exists. The beautification and city development frame is acknowledged, as many resettlements in Chennai stem from urban development initiatives. The rehabilitation and scheme frame reflects the government's inability to restore marginalized individuals to their previous living standards. A few schemes assist the impoverished during and post-eviction. However, many are unaware of such schemes, rendering them passive victims of resettlement. Evictions predominantly occur during the academic year, contravening guidelines aimed at protecting the education of slum children.

Consequently, the academic and educational frameworks have been delineated. The researcher recognizes the monsoon season frame as critical despite advisories against conducting evictions during this period. Nonetheless, evictions frequently transpire during monsoons, adversely affecting slum residents' livelihoods. The vulnerable population frame has been utilized to illustrate the heightened susceptibility of marginalized individuals. The researcher employs the social security frame to highlight the inconsistent distribution of monthly allowances to those affected by resettlement for duration of 12 months. The policy frame has been identified to clarify the existing policies for evicted individuals. Yet, the marginalized remain largely uninformed regarding these policies. The government appears indifferent to the struggles of impoverished urban slum dwellers and the implications of governmental policies on their lives. The researcher adopts the petition frame to underscore the numerous appeals from NGOs and citizens, asserting that resettlement housing resembles a 'concentration camp.' The recognition and rights frame is employed to elucidate the entitlements of slum inhabitants throughout the resettlement process. This approach seeks to empower urban slum residents to advocate for their rights and highlights their lack of recognition as citizens.

KEY FINDINGS: A SUMMARY AND DISCUSSION

- F The issues of displacement and resettlement not only affect a group of people but also have an adverse effect on all economic development and the country's social structure.
- F More articles have been published in The New Indian Express newspaper than in The Hindu and The Times of India newspapers.

- F The news reported by the journalist has more extensive coverage than the news reported by agencies.
- F The news reported by the journalist carries a more positive and empathetic tone, while the news reported by agencies mostly has a neutral tone.
- F Journalists' news sounds more authentic, whereas news agencies' reports are just information. The researcher, as a reader, could not connect to the article.
- F Journalist reports more news in The New Indian Express newspaper. Most of the news had extensive coverage of the issue.
- F Most of the news reported in The Times of India was by agencies. The Newspaper collected data from secondary sources and didn't devote much time and effort to collecting first-hand information.
- F Photographs and info-graphs are crucial in Newspapers for engaging readers and bringing their attention to the news, especially on issues related to resettlement. Pictures speak louder than words.
- F Most of the articles in The New Indian Express contain photographs and info-graphs, which enable the reader to connect and understand the issue more clearly.
- F The New Indian Express newspaper has gone the extra mile by presenting articles with photographs and info-graphs. This indicates more time and effort devoted to The New Indian Express newspaper.
- F The Overall tone of the news articles in The New Indian Express was positive and neutral. The opinions of both stakeholders were reported. The plights of the marginalized people were covered in-depth.
- F The overall tone of the news articles in The Times of India was negative or neutral, as few news articles didn't include the opinions and perspectives of the affected people.
- F The number of columns and the page numbers in which the articles were published play a significant role. It shows the significance of the issue. The first three pages of the News paper are of the most importance, and the value decreases gradually with the increasing page numbers.
- F The New Indian Express newspaper devoted more columns, and most of the news was published on the first three pages of the Newspaper. This suggests that more importance and significance were given to the concerned issues.
- F The episodic frame helps to bring more clarity to a particular issue and an in-depth focus on that specific issue. It demands more time and research. The thematic frame

is just an overall coverage and analysis of the issue. This doesn't require much time and effort.

- F The episodic frame brings more attention to the affected people's issues than the thematic frame.
- F The New Indian Express had a more episodic frame. The news focuses on issues like lack of basic amenities, water, electricity, education, pension, etc. More importance was given to the day-to-day problems faced by marginalized people. This indicates the rigorous research conducted by the Newspaper.
- F The Hindu Newspaper adopted a more thematic frame. The overall issue was covered without much extensive reporting.
- F The prognostic frame suggests solutions and resolving issues. The diagnostic frame merely highlights the conflict, while it is important to include the diagnostic frame by addressing the conflict and problems. The prognostic frame has a positive impact and change in society.
- F The New Indian Express had three follow-up stories. Through their news reporting, issues like water scarcity, open drainage, and house allotments were brought to the notice of the officials. And remedies were provided for the same. Such reporting had a positive impact on the lives of the affected people.
- F The Hindu Newspaper had a more diagnostic frame, where the reporting style was only tilted towards identifying the issue and not providing a remedy.
- F Following up with news helps to bring more attention and importance to the news. Sometimes, newspapers also pressure authorities and officials to take action quickly.
- F Objective and impartial news had more impact as the researcher could understand the viewpoint of both the parties involved. Hence, the researcher came to an unprejudiced conclusion during the analysis.
- F News papers that adopted different frames and approaches while covering news had more substantial coverage.
- F The researcher identified that The New Indian Express newspaper had more of a heterogeneous approach toward the slum dwellers than a homogenous one. This is exceptionally crucial, as each individual is different. Their story and experiences will vary from one to another. Hence, it is important not to generalize the population and their needs.
- F The resettlement process adversely affects the physical and financial health conditions and emotionally exhausts them.

- F The researcher identified that the government still lacks inculcating rehabilitation after eviction. They fail to restore the affected people's lives to their everyday, ordinary lives. In many cases, they are worse off than before.
- F The government has failed to bridge the gap between the marginalized people and the officials. There is enormous concern about accountability. The government policies and schemes are not reaching the target group. As they are poor and helpless people, they are unaware of whom to contact during a crisis.
- F During the eviction, the researcher learned that destitute women, disabled people, senior citizens, and children are the most affected, especially in cases of resettling during the academic year. Unfortunately, the education of the children leads to discontinuation in most cases.
- F The government has failed to provide basic amenities like schools, hospitals, and transportation facilities in the new resettled areas. Social infrastructure is absent. Even the physical infrastructure like electricity, good housing, and clean water is still a dream for many.
- F The schools in the newly resettled area lack basic facilities. These schools are overcrowded; they don't have chairs, desks, and proper amenities or environments for the kids.
- F The three main frames highlighted in all three newspapers were the social and physical infrastructure, accountability, and recognition and rights frames.
- F The researcher was able to analyze that most households don't receive their monthly allowance of 2500 rupees. They have only received their first instalment. This adds to their miserable condition.
- F Most households in the newly resettled area have issues like social networks and interruptions in their social network. As in the new resettled areas, people are allotted in different places and blocks. It becomes challenging for people to trust and adapt to the new neighborhood.
- F After the analysis, the researcher noted that most people suffer from water contamination and scarcity in the resettled sites. Due to this, there is a rise in contagious diseases.
- F People often lose their jobs, and there is a lack of new employment opportunities as the resettled locality is usually on the city's outskirts. The houses should be built in the city's heart to make it accessible for people experiencing poverty. Due to such hindrances, most people lose their jobs and find it hard to attain an alternative job.

- F There are concerns about the natural existence of law and order on these sites. There is a higher number of murders, harassment, and theft in these localities, according to newspaper reports.
- F The government has failed to fulfil the established human rights objectives by the United Nations, as there is a greater necessity for a good, appreciable standard of living. The government is answerable and responsible for the sub-standard living conditions of these powerless people.
- F The media bridges the gaps in society and identifies loopholes. The New Indian Express newspaper especially has brought these vulnerable's sorry state of affairs to light.
- F The researcher learned that many of these poor urban people have no documents claiming their citizenship, which makes the resettlement process more dreadful and unpleasant. Unfortunately, they don't have their ration card, Aadhar card, or voter I.D. card, which speaks for them.
- F Few journalists have done a remarkable job by becoming the voice and ear for the urban slum dwellers and using media most appropriately. They have contributed to social change and progress, which is the primary role of the press. Most of the people in the slums lack proper education and are functionally illiterate, which makes them more prone to exploitation.
- F The top 3 frames that the three English newspapers have adopted are the social and physical infrastructure frame, the accountability frame, and the recognition and rights frame, which have appeared the most.
- F The social and physical infrastructure frame talks about the basic amenities of the new resettled area and the physical infrastructure of the house and apartment.
- F The accountability frame states the communication issue faced by the marginalized people and the accountability of the officials towards them.
- F The recognition and rights frame indicated the rights of the people, like the right to basic allowance, education, affordable housing, a clean environment, etc.

RECOMMENDATIONS

- F The researcher has identified that most news articles lack an in-depth understanding of the issue. Issues like resettlement require more than just mere overall reporting. Because the resettlement affects the marginalized group and the society's general social structure, newspaper management should provide appropriate training to journalists reporting issues related to resettlement. This could be achieved by building tie-ups with various Indian and international organizations, non-profit organizations,

and educational institutions working in this field.

- F The tone adopted by the newspapers should either be positive or neutral. The perspectives of both stakeholders should be included. One way perspective will not provide much clarity to the news article.
- F The newspapers should travel the extra mile by reporting first-hand collected news by the journalist and avoid relying on second-hand information, the news reported by agencies as much as possible. Trained journalists should be appointed for the same. This will make the news more authentic, and extensive reporting of the issue will help the affected people.
- F The Newspaper should at least report three to four weekly articles on resettlement and displacement. Because it is a sorry state of affairs that impacts the country's entire economic and social structure.
- F The newspapers should bring positive change and impact by covering follow-up stories. Follow-up stories highlight the problem more and push the officials to bring a change.
- F The Newspaper should highlight more episodic frame issues, where the plight of the affected people is brought to the notice of the officials and the readers.
- F Journalists should be honest and objective while covering news; they should not insert their own beliefs and be subjective.
- F The journalist should follow the ethics of media and not take or give bribes while covering news related to resettlement. They should be sincere while procuring information. The repercussions of dishonesty in sensitive cases like displacement and resettlement are unpleasant.
- F Journalists should conduct proper research and do their best to understand and learn the background of the issue. They should not merely report the news but investigate and explore the truth.
- F The journalist should learn about the various policies and schemes for urban slum dwellers. Such knowledge can help them to generate a more solution-oriented, adopting prognostic frame in their reporting.
- F Journalists should avoid hate speeches or negative expressions as much as possible. While covering issues related to resettlement, the reporting style should be neutral and balanced.
- F Journalists should try to avoid words that are derogatory or provoke particular emotions.
- F The journalists are advised to wear clothes that are modest and essential. This will

help to reach and connect to the stakeholders better. The stakeholders should be able to relate to the reporters with ease.

- F The journalists are recommended not to wear expensive ornaments, accessories, or watches. This widens the gap between the urban slum dwellers and the reporter.
- F Journalists should always reveal their true identities and not fake or hide their identities while covering or recording the news.
- F The journalist should respect the law and refrain from reporting sensitive issues that could harm the state's security.
- F The journalist should refrain from bribing the stakeholders or receiving information from the stakeholders in exchange for some monetary benefits. This encourages unhealthy practices among them, and the nature of information could also be exaggerated and inaccurate.
- F The journalist should verify all the information and facts multiple times to avoid reporting false news. In the case of resettlement, every individual will have their perspective. It is extremely important only to report news that is verified and re-verified.
- F The journalists should try to add and insert more photographs and infographics in the news, which will enhance the value of the news.
- F The journalists are advised to avoid any piece of information which can trigger any conflict or dispute. They should try to instil peace and harmony.

CONCLUSION

Poor urban planning and migration of people from rural areas to urban areas in search of daily wages, jobs, employment opportunities, and education have led to a rise in the settlement of people in an urban slum structure with no tenure security and basic amenities. The only legislation enacted by Tamil Nadu is the Slum Areas (Improvement and Clearance) Act of 1971. Although the legislation looks promising, it fails to keep its promises. The Tamil Nadu slum clearance board only provides aid or support to the recognized slum areas through rehabilitation, resettlement and redevelopment of the slums. The unrecognized slums are likely to be more ignorant and remain invisible. The media's role is not restricted to only disseminating information; it is also accountable to the citizens and in charge of carrying out responsible coverage and reporting of news. The researcher identified 20 frames after analyzing three English newspapers. The New Indian Express newspaper, among the other two newspapers, has more responsible, in-depth reporting and coverage of issues related to resettlement. The tone of reporting news articles, especially on sensitive topics like resettlement, significantly impacts society.

REFERENCES

1. Ambey Kumar Srivastava, Lord's Education & Health Society. (2017). Segregated Data of Urban Poor for Inclusive Urban Planning in India: Needs and Challenges. Vol 7. Issue (1). doi.org/10.1177/2158244016689377
2. Cooper, S., Olejniczak, E., Lenette, C., & Smedley, C. (2017). Media coverage of refugees and asylum seekers in regional Australia: a critical discourse analysis. *Media International Australia*, 162(1), 78-89. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1329878X16667832>
3. Ganguly, Varsha. (2016). Special Issue on Land Acquisition, Rehabilitation and Resettlement in India. *Journal of Land and Rural Studies*. 4. 1-2. 10.1177/2321024915616668.
4. Gomersall, Kathryn. (2018). Resettlement practice and the pathway to the urban ideal. *Geoforum*. 96. 51-60. 10.1016/j.geoforum.2018.07.018.
5. Julian Kirchherr, Mats-Philip Ahrenshop, Katrina Charles, Resettlement lies: Suggestive evidence from 29 large dam projects, *World Development*, Volume 114, 2019, Pages 208-219, ISSN 0305-750X, <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.worlddev.2018.10.003>
6. Katharina Lunenberg, Jordy F. Gosselt, Menno D.T. De Jong. Framing CSR fit: How corporate social responsibility activities are covered by news media. *Public Relations Review*, Volume 42, Issue 5, 2016, Pages 943-951, ISSN 0363-8111. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.pubrev.2015.11.016>.
7. Kita, Stern. (2017). Urban vulnerability, disaster risk reduction and resettlement in Mzuzu city, Malawi. *International Journal of Disaster Risk Reduction*. 22. 158-166. 10.1016/j.ijdr.2017.03.010.
8. Parasuraman, S.. (1999). Development, Displacement and Resettlement in India: An Overview. 10.1007/978-1-349-27248-8_2.
9. Riano, Sandra. (2017). Framing Fear: A Critical Review of News Media's Coverage of Migrant Issues. 10.13140/RG.2.2.12536.34561.
10. Samling, C.L., Ghosh, A.K., Hazra, S. 2015. Resettlement and Rehabilitation: Indian Scenario. DECCMA Working Paper, Deltas, Vulnerability and Climate Change: Migration and Adaptation, IDRC Project Number 107642
11. Weerasena, L. N., Amaratunga, D., Hettige, S., Haigh, R., & Sridarran, P. (2018). Provision of Social Infrastructure for Resettled Victims of the 2004 Tsunami: Evidence from the grass roots. *Procedia Engineering*, 212, 379-386. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.proeng.2018.01.049>